
B&NES Placemaking Plan Examination: Hearing Statement Matter 2: Overall Approach

By Barton Willmore
On behalf of Taylor Wimpey

Representor no. 7138 Land near Minsmere Road and Manor Road

August 2016

**B&NES Placemaking Plan Examination:
Hearing Statement Matter 2: Overall Approach**

**By Barton Willmore
On behalf of Taylor Wimpey
Representor no. 7138**

Project Ref:	24712/A3/FW/jmm		
Status:			
Issue/Rev:	P1		
Date:	15 th August 2016		
Prepared by:	Faith Wright		
Checked by:			
Authorised by:			

Barton Willmore LLP
101 Victoria Street
Bristol
BS1 6PU

Tel: 0117 929 9677

Email: faith.wright@bartonwillmore.co.uk

Ref: 24712/A3/FW/jmm

Date: August 2016

COPYRIGHT

The contents of this document must not be copied or reproduced in whole or in part without the written consent of Barton Willmore LLP.

All Barton Willmore stationery is produced using recycled or FSC paper and vegetable oil based inks.

Issue 2 – whether the overall requirements of the adopted CS would be achieved through the Placemaking Plan

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 This Hearing Statement is submitted on behalf of Taylor Wimpey UK Limited in relation to Land at East Keynsham. As shown on the site plan at Appendix 1, Taylor Wimpey controls land at east Keynsham, lying to the east of Minsmere Road, which was removed from the Green Belt and is safeguarded in the Core Strategy. Taylor Wimpey is also in advanced negotiations with the vendor of the site to the south (accessed from Manor Road) which remains within the Green Belt and is shown edged in orange as 'future Taylor Wimpey land for removal from the Green Belt' on the site location plan at Appendix 1.

2.0 BACKGROUND

2.1 Having reviewed the draft Placemaking Plan and the evidence base, we consider that there is a real risk that the Placemaking Plan will not deliver the housing requirement of 13,000 homes contained in Core Strategy Policy DW1, for the following reasons:

- B&NES does not have a five year housing land supply;
- There is a history of slow housing delivery in the authority;
- There is a historic housing shortfall which needs to be provided for;
- The Placemaking Plan only allocates sites already within the planning system (with an allocation or planning application/permission);
- The Joint Spatial Plan for the West of England outlines significant future housing needs as demonstrated via the Strategic Housing Market Assessment for the Wider Bristol Housing Market Area (South Gloucestershire, North Somerset and Bristol), some of which will need to be accommodated in B&NES);
- The Core Strategy requirement of 13,000 homes is not a 'cap' and nor are the individual 'policy area' requirements – other suitable/sustainable sites should, therefore, be allocated in excess of this figure;
- Sites identified in SHLAA will not deliver housing as expected; and
- There is an over reliance on brownfield sites which can take a long time to deliver due to site specific issues such as contamination.

3.0 FIVE YEAR HOUSING LAND SUPPLY

3.1 The five year requirement for a Council is calculated by first multiplying the annual average housing requirement as set out in the local plan. We set out below our methodology and calculation of B&NES five year housing land supply requirement step by step below:

1. The B&NES Core Strategy housing requirement for the plan period is 13,000 homes and the plan period runs for 18 years. Therefore, on average the council needs to deliver 722 homes per year ($13,000 / 18 = 722$ homes);
2. The "basic" five-year housing requirement is 3,610 homes ($722 \text{ homes} \times 5 \text{ years} = 3,610$ homes). However, the council failed to deliver the average annualise requirement (722 homes) over the first 5 years of the plan period (2011/12 – 2015-16), only overseeing the delivery of 3,026 homes;
3. The shortfall over last 5 year is therefore 584 homes ($3,610$ minus $3,026$);
4. Adding in the 584 homes shortfall results in a five-year housing requirement of 4,194 homes (shortfall of 584 + basic requirement of 3,610 = 4,194 homes);
5. Apply the 20% buffer (para 47 of NPPF), given the persistent record of under-delivery of housing in B&NES, results in a five-year requirement of **5,033 homes** ($4,194 \times 1.2 = 5,033$ homes), or **1,007 homes** a year over the next 5 years ($5,033 / 5 = 1,007$ homes).

3.2 On the basis of the above, B&NES five year housing land supply requirement is 5,033 homes.

4.0 BARTON WILLMORE REVIEW OF BaNES FIVE HOUSING LAND SUPPLY

4.1 We have carried out a review of the sites included in B&NES five year housing land supply trajectory to identify the most up to date five year housing land supply position. The full methodology and background to our assessment is set out in our response to Matter 16, and in the interests of the Inspector's time and not duplicating content we have not repeated this detail in this hearing statement and instead a brief summary is included below:

- We examined the sites included in the December 2014 and April 2016 BaNES Housing Land Supply Findings Report and appended housing trajectories; as well as the housing land supply evidence submitted by BaNES and the Appellant Edward Ware Homes for Planning Appeals: (APP/FO114/A/14/2217216; APP/FO114/A/14/2215930 and APP/FO11114/A/2214596).
- The Edward Ware appeals identified 18 disputed sites contained in B&NES five year housing land supply, based on an analysis of the sites contained in the December 2014 Five Year Housing Land Supply Trajectory dated December 2014. Since that time B&NES has published an updated Housing Land Supply Findings Report and accompanying trajectory dated April 2016. For consistency, we have therefore carried out an analysis for a sample of B&NES' housing trajectory; namely 11 of the 18 disputed sites, based on the more recent figures from the April 2016 evidence base. Our assessment identifies 11 sites where the projected completion rates are called into question.
- Our analysis of the 11 sites is enclosed in at Appendix 2. The table includes the five year housing land supply figure for the period 2016 – 2021 included in the April 2016 trajectory as well as that included in the 2014 trajectory. The table includes our assumption of what we consider each site will deliver over the next five years and commentary to justify this in the final column. Our assumptions are based on our experience of site delivery, and the following key principles.
- Our analysis found that:
 - There are sites included which have an allocation but no planning permission. These need to be approached with caution, and as discussed above it is

unrealistic that any homes will be delivered on these sites within the next three years;

- Several of the sites included have outline planning permission, and will therefore still need approval of reserved matters and conditions, which can take several months, or years;
- Some of the sites do not have a formal planning permission, only a resolution to grant permission, and a Section 106 agreement still needs to be signed. This can often be a protracted process, which will then need to be followed by the approval of pre-commencement planning conditions and any reserved matters before work can commence on site. This process can be lengthy; and
- There are inconsistencies between the Housing Land Supply Findings Report (April 2016) and the Housing Trajectory which is appended to said report. For example the Fire Station is included in the trajectory as having the potential to deliver 90 homes over the next five years, but the Housing Land Supply Findings Report states that a prior approval application (LPA ref: 15/04723/ODCOU), was submitted in August 2015 for change of use from B1a (office) to 110 residential units but was subsequently withdrawn due to highways objection. It is therefore unclear why this site is still included in B&NES housing trajectory as a deliverable site.

4.2 Through our assessment of the 11 disputed sites, our total figure for these sites is 1,090 homes less than B&NES five year projection for these sites. As such, we have deducted this figure from B&NES total five year supply figure of 5,438 homes, and our assessment therefore finds that B&NES has a five year housing land supply of 4,348 homes, equating to 4.3 years. Our calculations and outputs are summarised below:

a) B&NES Housing land supply assessment:

- The council believes it has a deliverable supply of land for **5,438 homes** (2016/17 – 2020/21);
- This would equate to **5.4 years** of supply (5,438 homes supply / 1,007 homes needed a year = 5.4 years).

b) Barton Willmore Housing land supply assessment:

- We consider that the council only has at most a deliverable supply of land for **4,348 homes** (2016/17 – 2020/21);

- This equates to, at most, **4.3 years** of supply (4,348 homes supply / 1,007 homes needed a year = 4.3 years).
- 4.3 As outlined above, our analysis identifies, at most, a five year housing land supply of 4.3 years, which is a significant under supply. Due to the five year housing land supply shortfall and historic under provision of housing in B&NES, it is unlikely that the Core Strategy housing requirement will be met if further allocations are not made to address this risk.

5.0 PLACEMAKING PLAN DELIVERY OF THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE ADOPTED CS

- 5.1 If the 13,000 homes requirement is not delivered by the Placemaking Plan, the overall requirements of the Core Strategy will fail to be achieved. Specifically, Core Strategy Policy DW1 District-wide Spatial Strategy which includes the requirement for 13,000 homes would not be achieved, and the DW1 strategy to create a net increase in 10,300 jobs would be significantly undermined by an undersupply of housing.
- 5.2 The Placemaking Plan cannot meet the overall housing requirement of 13,000 homes with its current five year housing land supply shortfall. Until this housing deficit is met it is very unlikely that B&NES will meet its housing requirement.
- 5.3 Given that B&NES has a housing land supply shortfall and historic under provision of housing, it should be looking to release safeguarded sites, such as land lying to the East of Minsmere Road, East Keynsham, which has been removed from the Green Belt and safeguarded in the Core Strategy for housing under Policy KE3b Safeguarded Land at East Keynsham.
- 5.4 Safeguarded sites have already been assessed by the local plan process to be suitable for residential development, and these sites should be released now to address the housing shortfall. This is particularly important given the strategic context for future housing needs demonstrated by SHMA for the Wider Bristol HMA contained in the emerging Joint Spatial Plan (JSP) for B&NES, Bristol, South Gloucestershire and North Somerset. The JSP requires at least the delivery of 85,000 homes in the Bristol HMA over the next 20 years, and this figure is likely to be significantly increased in the next round of JSP consultation in September 2016, based on further evidence on housing need. Although the Wider Bristol HMA covers Bristol, North Somerset and South Gloucestershire and not B&NES, B&NES will still be required to allocate sites to contribute to the housing requirement under the Duty to Cooperate. The consequence of the JSP process is that the housing requirement for B&NES is likely to increase, and it would, therefore, at the least be "good planning" for B&NES to plan for this now by releasing Safeguarded Sites, to avoid the risk of further delays to the adoption of their Local Plan.
- 5.5 The NPPF 2012 is clear that at the heart of the National Planning Policy Framework is a presumption in favour of sustainable development, which should be seen as a golden thread running through both plan-making and decision-taking. For plan-making this

means that: local planning authorities should positively seek opportunities to meet the development needs of their area; Local Plans should meet objectively assessed needs, with sufficient flexibility to adapt to rapid change (Paragraph 14, NPPF). In order to meet the requirements of the NPPF, B&NES should be seeking to allocate Taylor Wimpey's site at East Keynsham, to contribute to the housing shortfall in a sustainable location and at a site considered by the Core Strategy as suitable for residential development.

- 5.6 The site can accommodate approximately 80 dwellings. If a planning application is lodged in 2016 we anticipate planning permission being granted in outline in quarter two of 2017 and reserved matters approval in quarter one of 2018. As such a start on site in quarter two or three of 2018 is very realistic. As a consequence, the site can be considered as deliverable in line with the definitions NPPF and could therefore assist B&NES with addressing the five year housing land supply shortfall.

6.0 CONCLUSION

- 6.1 On the basis of the above, we consider that in its current form the Placemaking Plan is unsound. B&NES has no five year housing land supply, which the Placemaking fails to address by allocating additional sites. B&NES should be seeking to allocate sites such as East Keynsham, which is a safeguarded site released for residential development, or risk the Plan being found unsound.
- 6.2 It fails to meet the NPPF tests of soundness of being positively prepared, justified, effective, or consistent with national policy. The draft Placemaking Plan is not flexible or adaptive to change and fails to consider the implications of the Joint Spatial Plan and the requirement to accommodate the housing need from the Wider Bristol HMA under Duty to Cooperate and in this respect it fails to be in accordance with national policy. The soundness of the Plan is significantly compromised by its lack of flexibility to respond and adapt to change. As such, we consider the Placemaking Plan to be unsound, and comprehensive work will need to be undertaken on the evidence base and housing need in order to deliver the objectives of the Core Strategy and the Joint Spatial Plan.

APPENDIX 1
SITE LOCATION PLAN

APPENDIX 2
BARTON WILLMORE FIVE YEAR
HOUSING LAND SUPPLY REVIEW TABLE

BANES 5YHLS REVIEW

Site	2014 5yhls for 2016 – 2021 (BANES Housing Trajectory 2011-2029, dated Dec 2014)	5yhls figure for 2016 – 2021 (BANES Housing Trajectory 2011-2029, dated April 2016)	Our figure	Comments
Bath				
MOD Warminster Road	175	175	75	Full permission (14/02272/EFUL) granted 03/03/2015 for 204 homes. No evidence that conditions are being discharged, although BANES state that the owners, Firestone, have commenced site clearance. Unlikely that any homes will be built in the next two years, but maybe 25 per year could be achieved 2018/2019 and 2020/2021
Rear of 89-123 Englishcombe Lane	20	40	0	The land has been allocated for the development of 40 dwellings since the adoption of the BANES Local Plan (2007). Council owned land which has not come forward due to the recession and a ransom strip. Council is currently agreeing terms to sell the site to Redcliffe. Given that a planning application hasn't even been prepared, very unlikely that any houses will be built in the next 5 years.
Roseberry Place	150	175	25	Outline application submitted 28/04/15 for 200 flats (15/01932/EOUT) received positive recommendation at committee in November 2015. Section 106 yet to be signed, after which reserved matters and conditions will need to be approved. Unlikely 175 homes will be built in next 5 years when Section 106 yet to be signed and conditions discharged.

Bath Press	200	244	50	<p>Application submitted (15/02162/EFUL) for 244 homes, which has received a recommendation for approval by officers and at committee but awaiting signed Section 106 with Meyer Homes.</p> <p>Unlikely 244 homes will be built in next 5 years when Section 106 yet to be signed and conditions discharged.</p>
Land at Odd Down	240	100	0	Allocated for 300 dwellings in the Core Strategy. Bloor Homes expected to submit an application in mid/late 2016
Keynsham				
Fire Station and Riverside, Keynsham	90	48	0	Housing Land Supply Report (April 2016) states that prior approval application submitted in August 2015 for change of use from B1a to 110 residential units (15/04723/ODCOU), but withdrawn due to highways objection – so why is this site still in the trajectory?
East of Keynsham (M&M)	225	100	25	<p>Allocated for 250 dwellings in the Core Strategy.</p> <p>Planning application submitted 23/02/16 (LPA ref: 16/00850/OUT) for 250 dwellings.</p> <p>Application not yet determined.</p> <p>It is unrealistic to expect that 100 homes will be built in the next 5 years, as the outline application needs to be approved and Section 106, followed by reserved matters and then conditions.</p>
South West Keynsham	579	381	173	<p>2007 Local Plan allocation.</p> <p>Western section granted planning permission for 285 dwellings (09/03351/FUL) and is being developed by Taylor Wimpey. 36 completions 2013/2014 and 62 in</p>

				<p>2014/2015.</p> <p>Eastern section (Bilbie Green) has planning permission for 267 dwellings (14/00049/FUL) and is being built out by Barratt and David Wilson Homes. 6 homes were built 2015/2016.</p> <p>Current completion rate equates to 34 dwellings a year, multiplied by 5 years this is 173 homes.</p>
Somer Valley				
Old Pit Yard, Clandown	53	44	25	<p>Outline planning permission for 44 dwellings granted in October 2015 (14/02889/OUT)</p> <p>No evidence that reserved matters have been submitted or conditions are being discharged</p>
Welton, Bibby and Baron	150	100	0	<p>Draft Placemaking Plan proposes to allocate the site for 100 dwellings.</p> <p>No application submitted, but pre-application discussions undertaken.</p>
St Peters Factory	70	81	25	<p>2007 Local Plan allocation. Oval Estates submitted an application in October 2014 for 91 dwellings (14/04003/OUT) which was subsequently reduced to 81 dwellings and planning permission was granted 02/03/2016.</p> <p>No evidence that reserved matters have been submitted or any conditions have been discharged.</p> <p>Unlikely that any dwellings will be built in the next 3 years, but potential for some completions in the last 2 years.</p>
Total		1,488 homes	394 homes	